Radio 4 "The Caste Divide" - April 2003

BBC's community affairs reporter Naresh Puri investigates the rise of one of the most hidden forms of hierarchy in Britain today: The Indian Caste system.

[John Cleese] "I look down on him because I am upper class."

[Ronnie Corbett] "I look up to him because he is upper class."

The British class system as parodied by John Cleese and the Two Ronnies in *The Frost Report*.

"I know my place." [laughter].

Since the end of the Second World War, the class system has been the butt of many jokes, but it's been the enemy of politicians such as John Major who aimed to bring about what he described as a truly classless society. But there are many who argue that there is now another equally potent but imported form of social hierarchy taking hold in Britain – and that's the Indian caste system.

"Caste has caused division and it does cause social devastation. The problem is that nobody has accepted the problem within this country. Caste is one area which is totally swept under the carpet.

"I don't feel hurt by the racial discrimination. It's the caste system, which makes me feel absolutely disgusted. People of the same stock, people from the same continent, people with the same problems, they practice the caste discrimination and they make you feel subhuman.

"Our Indian people have come to England, they go to America, they go to Canada, they go to all over Europe, but unfortunately, wherever they go they take caste system with them as well."

The voices of British Indians who've made their home in contemporary multicultural Britain. Yet today, they still feel they can be victimised because of the caste system. Caste is often associated with rural India - a time and place at odds with British Society today. It's a system of hierarchy in which birth determines who is at the top of the social ladder and who is at the bottom. For many of the nearly 1 million Britains of Indian origin, the caste system continues to exert a powerful influence over their everyday lives. It can determine who they can marry, who they socialise with, which temple they pray at, and whether they will have any respect amongst their peers. But it is still a subject which within the Indian community here are unwilling to discuss openly. At the heart of this discomfort are a group of people who are considered to be beneath the rest of society – the Untouchables. There are now an estimated 200,000 people from formerly Untouchable backgrounds living in the UK. They include second and third generation Indians many of them who don't want to categorise themselves as Untouchables, but find that others do. Brother and sister Rama and Parveen are one such example.

[Rama] "There's trouble everywhere. You can go to Derby; you can go to Birmingham. Go to the student nights and you see it. Someone will get called a name and it will all kick off from there, and then get what you will call a ruck on your hands."

[Parveen] "Yeah. I wasn't aware that this caste thing existed in my community. It meant nothing to me until I went to university, and then suddenly my caste was more important than the degree I was doing and the person I was. It wasn't, 'What are you doing? What sort of person are you?' It was, 'What caste are you? And then I'll decide if I want to be friends with you."

So basically even in this day and age you still got abuse?

[Rama] "We get treated like lower class. They believe they are the tractor drivers and we are their farm workers, we pull out the potatoes while they eat."

And *they* refers to the traditional high caste of Hindu society, the Brahmins whose job it was to pursue knowledge whilst the Shudras at the bottom were traditionally occupied with menial work. Untouchables often called *chooras* and *chamars* were considered even beneath this – falling outside the system altogether. The roots of

Rama and Parveen's experience lie back in India where the State legally outlawed the status of 'Untouchability' in the 1950s. But traditional hostility towards 'Untouchables' remained. Many first-generation British Indians clearly remember these experiences, such as Ram Lakha.

"Back in the school, back in India, we were not allowed to drink water from the same pitcher. Somebody had to pour the water onto my hands so I can drink whereas others could pick up the glass and drink it. I had a rotten bag which I used to push all the books in. People used to drop mud, bricks, leaves and everything into my bag but I couldn't do much about it. I was beaten up by the kids because they thought I was not supposed to be equal to them."

Although British Indians don't have to contend with such severe discrimination, experiences such as Ram Lakha's have permeated Indian cultural memory and continue to exert a potent force on relations between castes in Britain today. That's because, unlike the class system, the notion of pollution is at the heart of the Indian caste structure. Bhikhu Parekh, a Centennial Professor at the London School of Economics and the Chair of the recent commission on the future of multiethnic Britain:

"Those people who are engaged in work which one considers as dirty, like collecting human dirt, which was not only seen as very menial, but also activities which could spread disease. These people were kept at a distance because they were sources of infection, if you like. So there was a moral pollution because they were not good enough to other things. There was physical pollution because they dealt with human dirt and therefore these people were regarded as those people not to be touched. Hence they came to be called Untouchables. The British called them 'depressed classes' and Gandhiji called them 'Harijans' (children of God) and today they call themselves 'Dalits' which means 'the Oppressed'."

The roots of the caste system and untouchability might seem to lie in ancient Hindu culture dating back some 5000 years. But there is an increasingly held view that it was the encounter between two hierarchical cultures a few hundred years ago that gave us the caste system we've inherited today. Judith Brown is a professor of Hinduism studies at Oxford University.

"The British who actually went to India in the late 19th and 20th century were very much from one social world in Britain, the professional administrative class or the officer class in the army and that slotted like another caste at the top of the hierarchy. They found no difficulty in understanding a hierarical society because they came from near the top of one themselves."

"The later part of the British rule turned caste into the basis of Hindu society. They took an extremely rigid and static view. And therefore they created the illusion that caste was primordial that they have always existed and from 1931 when British made caste as one of the important issues to collect data in the census it became rigid. Once people felt that they had identified themselves as belonging to caste a or b, they somehow had to stick to it."

And another result of that interaction between these two cultures has resulted in this - Southall in West London one of the numerous established areas across the country today. It's a place where more than 50 years of migration has created a town which local people fondly refer to as 'Little India'. As another Asian part of the UK they've brought with them their cultural landscape, music, their food and their own brand of shops. And of course, they have also imported religion and social values too. When mass migration took off in the 50s, the vast majority who arrived were men who left their families behind. Initially caste had little impact on their lives. But as large scale migration continued in the 60s and 70s, caste acquired greater significance. Parminder Singh is a former deputy chair of the Commission for Racial Equality.

"As the size of the migrant community increased, particularly in terms of families joining their breadwinners, caste became a prominent issue because once the families are there then the question arises of people trying to find partners for their children. It is in this context that caste got its traditional significance."

And today many second and third generation Indians are still encouraged to have arranged marriages where their partners are from the same caste as them. Even those who don't have their marriages arranged are taught the importance of staying within the

boundaries of caste. Those ignoring this can find themselves cut off from family and communities – as this young man who wanted to remain anonymous found out:

"I met [NAME?] and just like started meeting each other and started falling in love slowly. Then we just thought we should get married. Her parents didn't agree. I'm quite educated. I had good jobs, worked for banks. They would only oppose us because they thought they were of a higher creed or caste than myself. Nothing else. Her parents started beating her up. One day her dad beat her up so much that I had to take her away from that house. Her back was, like, full of bruises and everything and I took her to the doctors. I was like under so much stress that how could people do this to their own daughter. They are like willing to hurt their daughter. They are willing to throw her away just because they think the person she loves is lower than them."

You were both totally cut off from her parents?

"I didn't stop her from seeing her parents but she would say that like you are not allowed to go there, let me go myself this and that. So I let her do it, but deep down I was thinking if they don't accept me as your husband, you're doing the same thing. I let it all go because I didn't want to put pressure on her. So eventually they just brainwashed her and ruined our marriage."

Was it caste that ultimately broke down your marriage?

"Yes, caste. Silly caste system."

[Ends]

"How old are you?

I'm 28 years old."

Here at the Suman Bureau, one of Britain's oldest matrimonial agencies, many second and third generation Indians still come for help in finding a life partner. Caste is still a strong factor according to the owner Parar Bagawar.

"People are still mentioning the issue of caste and bringing it up when it comes to marriage and generally it is the lower caste that are sort of outcaste is the word simply because people don't want to marry into a lower caste. And then we also find these days that those who originate from a lower caste prefer to meet someone of the same background because they know that they will perhaps be victimised so to say the fact that they are of a lower caste. The first generation are still around and have very strong beliefs and to some extent they have put those beliefs into their children as well.

[Bhikhu Parekh] "If somebody came and said he was an ex-'Untouchable' I think many progressive Hindus, however they may try to get rid of caste, would somehow feel they were superior and this man was inferior and that their daughters and sons shouldn't marry. But if you look at the rest of the Hindus, there the caste system is in decline. There is a great feeling here and as in India that unless Hindus unite they will not be able to make much progress. So middle and higher caste are beginning to unite. Roughly, I would say that nearly 25 percent of the Hindu marriages here in Britain are taking place across the caste barriers."

But that change at the top does not seem to be filtering down. For those from the lower caste, marriage from outside their communities remains fraught with difficulties. There is evidence that some of them are changing their names to disguise their backgrounds. Parar Bagawar:

"It does become a big problem. We've seen it a lot for example that in the Hindu community. There are a lot of Sharmas all of a sudden which is supposed to be a Brahmin, very high-caste. And the way you actually find out the reality is you ask them the roots, where they originate from and that is when you actually establish that they are not as Brahmin as they say they are."

So, on a lot of occasions you're not simply a marriage bureau, but you have to investigate people?

"Yes, we do for some clients. If they actually need us to then we can advise further. Normally it means going to deeper into the roots of where they originate from, what names have been used in the past."

But many people in Britain are no longer prepared to hide their identities.

[Recording of someone speaking in Punjabi.]

A religious service being conducted in Punjabi. But this isn't taking place in a mosque or a temple – it's a Christian church in Wolverhampton. The majority of recent converts here are former 'Untouchables'. There are now over 100 Asian Christian congregations in the UK stretching from Glasgow to Southampton. Pradeep Sudhra is the Chair for the Alliance for Asian Christians and preaches to low-caste Hindus:

"It is not the Dalit or the downtrodden person who needs Hinduism, it is the Brahminal and philosophical Hinduism that needs the oppressed people in order for their system to work. And really to be quite frank, I'm quite pleased that people who've been oppressed all these centuries are finding their own ways. I seek anyone unashamedly and preach to them in freedom in Jesus Christ. And if the Dalit are set free from that oppression because of my preaching about Jesus Christ, then I thank God for it."

A lot of Hindus say you are taking away Hindus from the fold of Hinduism in the name of Christianity. You get hate mail?

"The air becomes blue when you read some of the hate mail I get, but then that's part of life. If in my dying or in my living I see even just one little child set free, then thank God for it."

But this attitude concerns many Hindus in Britain who point towards the controversy surrounding the issue of conversion in India. Their Christian missionaries have been attacked and some have lost their lives amid growing anger at mass conversions of low caste Hindus. [Nolekant Bringal] represents the British section of Hindu Parashad, an organisation which is at the heart of the Hindu nationalist campaign in India.

"We have great respect for Christianity. There are good churches and we work with them here and in Britain but we do have certain fears. There are some Christian movements, evangelical movements, whose agenda is to convert and that breaks our Hindu society because conversion by attacking another religion by exploiting the ignorance, is something to be discouraged. Hinduism is reformative. It goes through reformations. If there are bad practices which have crept in, we appeal to modern Hindu society to reject them and reform."

While the VHP is keen to distance Hindu from caste prejudice, many people are worried that the consciesiousness of caste has also crept into a religion which was mean to bring about equality.

[A Sikh prayer.]

A reading from a Sikh holy book the Shri Guru Granth Sahib. Sikhism was founded in India in the late 15th century by a former Hindu, Guru Nanak, a strong opponent of the caste system. Those Hindus at the time who converted to the new religion were attracted to its egalitarian message. Suresh Grover is the chair of the National Civil Rights Movement:

"Sikhism was a rebellion against the Hindu caste system amongst other things. It was a rebellion against autocratic regimes that existed at that time. That is why everybody as a was Sikhism is called a Singh and woman is called a Kaur because you couldn't distinguish the caste system, but Sikh people talk about the greatness of the Gurus but they never talk about the manner in which Sikhism was evolved to tackle caste. So the fundamental lessons of Sikhism is never developed."

Many Sikhs now accept that their faith, which was originally intended to break down the caste barrier, has in fact absorbed them. The Sikh peasantry known as the jats believe they occupy the top position of the social ladder. Indeed many jats such as Balbir Grewal who heads Southall's Guru Granth Sahib temple are proud of their caste heritage. She is a rare voice amongst the Indian community who is willing to speak out about the importance of maintaining a caste identity.

"My father used to tell me you are born jat and you will die a jat. Everybody be proud of whatever creed caste they are and I think we should stick to it. It's like roots. How can you plant a tropical plant into a cold country? It has to be in a tropical country otherwise you are lost. We are already lost in this country by eastern and western cultures and if this carries on the time will come nobody will know which background religion or caste they come from."

And the importance of maintaining a caste identity has not been ignored by the young British Sikhs.

[Bhangra singing and music]

In fact it has been central to the development of Britain's Punjabi dance music bhangra. Bobby Friction hosts Radio 1's Asian underground music show.

"On a purely bhangra level there are many songs about jat pride, about the life of a jat, almost jat nationalism is running rampant in bhangra music now to the point where every bhangra album that comes out Britain has at least one track that alludes to the power of the jats. One of the most famous bhangra songs is ever is 'Putha jatta de' which mean we are the sons of jats and we are proud of who we are and what we do."

[Bhangra music]

But why are the young British Sikhs so committed to the idea of a caste identity?. One event in recent Sikh history may offer an explanation.

[Old radio broadcast in English]

"The crisis involving Sikh extremist in Punjab has come to a climax in a bitter pitched battle between government troops and Sikhs holding out in their holy shrine in the Golden Temple at Amritsar. In heavy fighting, which began last night 300 hundred people, have been killed – 250 of them Sikhs."

The hostility between Indian troops and Sikh separatist militants ended in the invasion of the Golden Temple in 1984 was the watershed in modern Sikh history. Bobby Friction says the rising tide of nationalism in India translated into a stronger caste conciouness amongst young Sikhs.

"The Sikh nationalist movement in the 80s was jat-led. Their politics were specifically designed to appeal to the jat masses. Now when that filtered back to England, I think a lot of jats in England became more nationalistic. There were a lot of human rights atrocities committed by the Indian Government. About 90 per cent of the men whose lives were lost were jat. A lot of the militants started playing on that. It first started out as our Sikh men are being killed and it literally came down to the Indian government is killing our jat men. So it didn't actually help the cause of no caste in our religion."

[Sikh prayer]

A growing awareness of caste amongst both Sikhs and Hindus in Britain has let to another phenomenon – the building of temples based on caste. A large number of Sikh and Hindu temples across the UK are now run along caste lines. Members of each caste attending their very own temple. Guru Ravidass Gurdawara in Bedford is one such Sikh temple which caters for former Untouchables known as Ravidassis. They worship their own guru – Guru Ravidass, who championed rights of the Untouchables and his birthday is the biggest yearly event within the community. According to Gurmail Singh Chambers who is one of the Trustees of the Temple:

"This is what you can say is our Christmas Day today. So as far as the Ravidassi community is concerned once a year the whole of the community get together to celebrate Guru Maharaj's birthday celebration and it will go on all day today until 6 or 7 o'clock. There will be fireworks tonight and the whole of the building will be lit up."

This is the big day?

"This is the day. This is the day I would say."

The temple is a lavishly constructed building costing nearly a million pounds and is equipped with a gym and a community centre. But Mr Chambers says the decision to build their own temple came out of necessity rather than choice.

"When I came to England in 1964, I noticed that there was a need because when I talked to the older people they told us that there was a Sikh gurdwara here but we were no not really treated as equals."

What did people say to you?

"People used to say 'Eh chamar va, ethokaur passe lelo othe pass bar nekal do'."

So basically they were saying, 'Take their money and then kick them out of the temple.'?

"Yes. So we started hiring halls and in 1974 we bought our own building. That was in Queens Park, the old Methodist church."

But there are many amongst the Indian community who feel the proliferation of temples along caste lines is creating profound divisions. Suresh Grover from the National Civil Rights Movement:

"Lots of local authorities give permissions for temples to be developed. And if you look at any Indian area in this country, they will allow not just a temple run on the basis of Brahmins but all lower castes. In fact what it does is consolidate and institutionalise caste discrimination."

We contacted several local authorities in Asian areas across the UK with existing temples. They confirmed that specific questions about caste are not asked when they make the decisions to give grants to local communities for temples to be built. They say that it is a very difficult situation to monitor.

Here at the Valmiki temple in West London built for a group of former Hindu 'Untouchables', caste divisions have led to a very public rift within the Hindu community. The Valmikis who attend the temple outrightly reject their roots. Piaralal Sobah is the cultural secretary at the temple.

"Hinduism is a very wide term not meaning religion, it means people. If we are applying Hinduism as people, then yes, we are Hindus. But if we are saying we are Hindu religion then we are not because the Hindus have not accepted us for a long time. They have not now, and they never will. So how can you say are we Hindus. No."

"I have been at many meetings where the Valmikis or the *chamars* or the ex-'Untouchables' strongly disassociate themselves from Hindu society and would have nothing to do with it. That trend is there. But I would have thought that this kind of isolation will sooner or later break down because there will be enough common interests to bind us together. For example if the Valmikis isolate themselves and they don't achieve well educationally or economically then they will have to fight for equal opportunities, therefore they will have to unite with other high-caste Hindus and so on. So I would have thought the compulsions of politics will force them to come closer." [Bhikhu Parekh]

That compulsion to bind has not always been successful in uniting the British Indian community. When it comes to life in the private sphere, whether it is marriage or worshipping in a temple, those from the lowest castes feel they have been held back because of their place in the social hierarchy. And that sense of alienation has also spilled over to public life as well. Ram Lakha is a labour councillor in Coventry and from a formally 'Untouchable' background:

"I became first a councillor in 1989. My name was put forward by the Labour Party and members of the Labour Party but there was a lot of resentment on my selection. One of the relatives came to tell me in the pub when we were having a pint. He came to tell me that such and such person came to say, 'Why are you going to vote for him because he is a *chamar?'* So there was some kind of whispering campaign within the membership and though I got through the first time, they increased the Labour Party membership. It was unfair the way it was put in. Members didn't know they were members. They were brought in to vote me out. They did the next year. They could not stomach that a person like me should be a community leader for them when they are from a so-called high caste. They had to wage a campaign to get me out. And I was out."

Were you bitter?

"I was bitter. It is natural. But I knew that if I just keep showing the bitterness, that's what they want. So I found another ward where there were no Indians and that's where I came in and there was not a single member of Indian. I succeeded from there. I am still there from a long time."

But these allegations are denied by Gordon Wright who was the secretary of the Labour Party's Northeast Coventry constituency at the time:

"There's no way people would have recruited people to come in specifically to vote against Mr. Ram Lakha. One has to remember that at that time there was a conflict between the moderates in the party and those that we considered to be the leftwingers of the party. He was regarded as a left-winger. He was deselected because he was on the wrong side at the time."

And obviously you are talking about politically and not castewise?

"Oh no, not castewise. I mean, I did know that there is a caste system for Hindus and some of a higher caste would look down on those considered to be of a lower caste with some disdain but certainly nothing was ever brought into the open on that. If there had been a campaign about it, certainly I would have acted upon it. But what one Asian says to another in a conversation has really nothing to do with me.

"I think white colleagues are aware of the issue. They know that this is going on in the Indian community but they also know that they need the votes because I don't have that many votes in our community, neither Ravidassi community nor Valmiki community. We haven't got that many votes city-wide were are a very small community. So they need the votes. The democracy is immobility in that sense." [Ram Lakha]

And it is not just politics where accusations of caste prejudice abound. Many members of the lower caste feel that leaders of the Asian community are not doing enough to counter caste discrimination. In fact some go even further in their criticism of community leaders. Davinder Prasad is from the Voice of Dalit International, a group which campaigns for the rights of former 'Untouchables'.

"I find some people who are heavily involved in promoting racial equality, they are fighting campaigns to promote equality in Indian and English people, but the same people, when it comes to their brothers and sisters they are the people who are promoting caste discrimination of their own people."

Davinder Prasad recalls one key incident in his local city Coventry which involved a booklet under the guidance of local councillor

"I wouldn't name the person but he is a Brahmin councillor who was the chairman of the social equality department of Coventry City Council. This booklet 'A guide to minority ethnic customs religions and aiming systems in Coventry' was issued by his department in 1995/96. Now it describes the Hindu caste system 'Caste is inherited by birth and one cannot change or leave one's caste. Hindus in Britain may wish to observe the caste system and wish to avoid dining and intermarriage with members of other castes.'It's unbelievable this booklet was coming out of Coventry City Council - a government agency. If this was published in any Indian government department or office the head of the department there would have had to resign."

That draft booklet was eventually withheld and Coventry City Council issued an apology. The councillor in question who devised the text of the booklet, Prashotam Lal Joshi, was not placed on any disciplinary action. But when we contacted Mr Joshi with regards to the incident, he began by saying he regretted the decision to make a reference to the caste system:

"I regret that because that has done a lot of harm on the way things are developing people belonging to higher caste are placed in a very difficult position. When I was a councillor a document was produced where there was only very small reference towards 'Untouchables' and they created the allegations. These castes have become very sensitive; they're very vocal. Difficulty in defence that lot can be said but there are very few people that have come forward."

[Recording of children playing in playground.]

The emphasis on cultural diversity has nowadays led to schools like this one teaching as many as four or five religions to its pupils. Hinduism is one of the religions taught as part of the curriculum at secondary school. Students are given an introduction to the main caste groups within the Hindu tradition and taught that a hereditary system where birth determines one's place in society. Many former 'Untouchables' such as Davinder Prasad find this extremely uncomfortable:

"It is very unfortunate. My children come home and ask me 'What are we?" and I have to explain to them that we are not in the caste system and it confuses them because, as a part of that national curriculum in schools, as a part of Hinduism, children are being taught about their position in the caste system. Unfortunately, our people, most of them, were illiterate, they did not have any clue about government education systems and first generation Asians, particularly those of the high caste educated back in India, they had a change to get involved with formulation of schools' curriculums and schools educational policies. Somebody has knowingly done this and we want to undo it."

We asked the Department for Education for a response about the continuing presence of caste in the national curriculum but they declined to comment directly on the issue. However, they wish to point out that in a recent introduction to citizenship as a subject on the national curriculum, pupils are given a distinct opportunity to develop an understanding of the nature

of prejudice but many like Judith Brown believe that it is the responsibility of those within the British Indic community to bring about change in educational policy:

"It is in a sense, up to Hindu communities of Britain to put pressure on those who make the national curriculum. It is very difficult if people who are outside the tradition have to try to describe it without help from those inside. The problem with 'Untouchables', that even here in Britain they tend to have come from such deprived backgrounds in India, it takes a while before they are in a position to be able to exercise clout and leverage in the public sphere."

[Recording of bhangra music.]

In today's multicultural Britain it may be hard to believe caste can exert such a powerful influence. The values of meritocracy are at the heart of contemporary British society – values that most people believe that whatever their background they can succeed through their own efforts. And many within the British Indian community believe that a classless society cannot truly exist when a caste system is in place. But Bhikhu Parekh sees no contradiction here. He believes that it's possible to subscribe to the notion of meritocracy and still retain a caste identity:

"The evolution of caste here is proceeding along the same lines as caste in India. Caste becomes more like a civic association, a network from where you can get capital, a network where from you can get your clients if you are setting up a business, a network of people who will canvass for you in local or national elections. Full stop. In other words what people are now doing with the caste system, they want to get rid of its unacceptable dimensions like restrictions of marriage or dining. Take full advantage of and immobilise its full potentialities which will stand them in good stead in country and therefore caste in some form is bound to stay for a long time because people see advantages in it. And I can see that it is a good rational negotiating strategy."

However, other such as Suresh Grover remains spectacle about this kind of rational strategy. He feels that unless caste prejudice is recognised as a form of institutional discrimination, it will remain a potent form of racism within the Asian community

"No form of behaviour which deliberately leads to people being marginalised and treated as subhuman should be tolerated by a society which believes in universal rights. The reason why it has been that good because there isn't an understanding of multicultural there isn't an understanding of pluralist living and thought in our community. People see Indian communities as homogeneous, one form of religion, one form of ideas. Those notions have to be destroyed. So if there has got be a relationship between the British State and the Asian community, that understanding has to be that we believe in human rights. So the Government are judged by it and held accountable. But also those who say they are leaders of the Asian community are tested on the same basis to see if they offer universal rights to others and that should be the measure of their understanding of racism in this country. Not simply dealing with the issue of white racism but dealing with prejudice and discrimination within their own communities."

But for Davinder Prasad and the many others, who have traditionally been outcaste by Indian society, gradual institutional change may be too slow in coming. As they enjoy unprecedented affluence and move up the economic and educational hierarchy look forward to a Britain where a caste system cannot survive.

"We can survive ourselves. We have got our own places of worship. We are trying to re-discover our own history and we will not be bullied or dictated by high caste people. This is the thing some of the high caste people are finding it difficult to accept. But I tell you, this will happen in the future, and they won't have a choice. This century is going to be our opportunity. We will have qualifications, we will have education. With education we will have power. This century is going to be our century."

[Flute playing.]

END